

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|---|------------|
| <i>Preface to the Second Edition by the Co-Editors</i> | <i>i</i> |
| <i>Foreword to the Second Edition by Mads Andenæs</i> | <i>iii</i> |
| <i>Preface to the First Edition by Serge Brammertz</i> | <i>ix</i> |
| <i>Foreword to the First Edition by the Editor</i> | <i>xi</i> |
| <i>Foreword to the First Edition by LING Yan</i> | <i>xix</i> |
| 1. Non-Criminal Justice Fact-Work in the Age of Accountability 1 | |
| <i>By Marina Aksanova, Morten Bergsmo and Carsten Stahn</i> | |
| 1.1. Quality Control in Fact-Finding: Questions and Definitions | 1 |
| 1.2. Overview of Fact-Finding Mandates | 13 |
| 1.2.1. Sanctioning Body | 13 |
| 1.2.2. Scope of the Mandate | 17 |
| 1.2.3. Outcome of the Mission | 19 |
| 1.3. Chapter Contributions | 21 |
| 1.4. Further Research Agenda | 26 |
| 1.4.1. Substantive Issues | 26 |
| 1.4.2. Procedural Issues | 29 |
| 1.5. Conclusion | 31 |
| 1.6. Annex: Some International Fact-Finding Mandates 1992–2020 | 32 |
| 2. Quality Control in International Fact-Finding Outside Criminal Justice for Core International Crimes 45 | |
| <i>By Richard J. Goldstone</i> | |
| 2.1. Introduction | 45 |
| 2.2. The Approach of this Chapter | 46 |
| 2.3. Clayton Sithole Inquiry | 47 |
| 2.4. Sebokeng | 48 |
| 2.5. The Goldstone Commission | 50 |
| 2.6. The Oil-for-Food Inquiry | 53 |
| 2.7. The Gaza Fact-Finding Mission | 56 |
| 2.8. Quality Control | 60 |
| 2.9. Conclusion | 62 |

| | | |
|------|---|-----|
| 3. | Improving Fact-Finding in Treaty-Based Human Rights Mechanisms and the Special Procedures of the United Nations Human Rights Council..... | 63 |
| | <i>By Martin Scheinin</i> | |
| 3.1. | Introduction | 63 |
| 3.2. | Fact-Finding by UN Human Rights Treaty Bodies | 64 |
| | 3.2.1. Typology of Monitoring Mechanisms under Human Rights Treaties | 65 |
| | 3.2.2. Fact-Finding in the Reporting Procedure..... | 67 |
| | 3.2.3. Fact-Finding in the Procedure for Individual Complaints | 68 |
| | 3.2.4. Fact-Finding in Inquiry Procedures by Treaty Bodies ... | 71 |
| | 3.2.5. Improving Fact-Finding by Treaty Bodies..... | 73 |
| 3.3. | Fact-Finding by the Special Procedures of the Human Rights Council | 75 |
| | 3.3.1. Basic Facts about Special Procedures..... | 76 |
| | 3.3.2. Fact-Finding by Special Procedures | 76 |
| | 3.3.3. Improving Fact-Finding by Special Procedures | 79 |
| 3.4. | Conclusion | 80 |
| 4. | Justified Belief in the Unbelievable | 81 |
| | <i>By Simon De Smet</i> | |
| 4.1. | Introduction | 81 |
| 4.2. | What is Fact-Finding? | 83 |
| 4.3. | Two Approaches Towards Justifying Beliefs..... | 85 |
| | 4.3.1. Probabilistic Account of Fact-Finding | 86 |
| | 4.3.2. Inference to the Best Explanation | 97 |
| 4.4. | Three Building Blocks of Fact-Finding | 106 |
| | 4.4.1. Optimal Evidential Dataset | 107 |
| | 4.4.2. Correct Credibility Assessments | 119 |
| | 4.4.3. Correct Inferences..... | 133 |
| 4.5. | Conclusion | 141 |
| 5. | Quality Control in Truth and Reconciliation Processes | 145 |
| | <i>By LIU Daqun</i> | |
| 5.1. | Introduction | 145 |
| 5.2. | Definition and Mandate | 146 |
| 5.3. | Establishment and Composition | 149 |
| 5.4. | Standards of Proof | 151 |
| 5.5. | Standard Procedure of Interview | 153 |

| | | |
|--------|---|-----|
| 5.6. | Resources..... | 154 |
| 5.7. | Engaging Individuals and the Public | 155 |
| 5.8. | Final Report..... | 156 |
| 5.9. | Conclusion..... | 157 |
| 6. | Quality Control and the Mandate of International Fact-Finding | 159 |
| | <i>By FAN Yuwen</i> | |
| 6.1. | Introduction | 159 |
| 6.2. | Model of Mandates for International Fact-Finding Commissions: A Comparative Perspective..... | 161 |
| 6.2.1. | Minimum Core Elements of a Proper Mandate | 161 |
| 6.2.2. | Implied Mandate..... | 164 |
| 6.2.3. | Extended Mandate | 165 |
| 6.3. | Proposed Criteria for the Mandates of International Fact-Finding Missions | 166 |
| 6.3.1. | Previous Experiences on Criteria for Mandates | 167 |
| 6.3.2. | Layered Approach of Criteria for Mandates | 170 |
| 6.4. | Conclusion..... | 172 |
| 7. | Coherence in the Design and Implementation of the Mandates of International Fact-Finding Commissions: Internal and External Dimensions | 173 |
| | <i>By Isabelle Lassée</i> | |
| 7.1. | The Need for a Contextual and Purposive Intervention: Towards External Coherence | 175 |
| 7.2. | Increasing Internal Coherence: The Importance of Relevant and Well-Supported Recommendations | 185 |
| 7.3. | Contours of the Teleological Approach and Justification of the Division of Labour between Mandating Bodies and Commissions of Inquiry | 191 |
| 7.4. | Conclusion..... | 196 |
| 8. | Quality Control and the Selection of Members of International Fact-Finding Mandates | 199 |
| | <i>By WU Xiaodan</i> | |
| 8.1. | Introduction | 199 |
| 8.2. | The Significance of Member Selection for the Credibility, Legitimacy and Effectiveness of Fact-Finding Mandates | 201 |
| 8.3. | Concerns about the Partiality, Unfairness and Inappropriateness of Fact-finders | 203 |

| | | |
|---------|---|-----|
| 8.3.1. | The Commission of Experts for the Former Yugoslavia..... | 204 |
| 8.3.2. | The International Commission of Inquiry Concerning Rwanda..... | 206 |
| 8.3.3. | The Fact-Finding Mission on the Gaza Conflict..... | 206 |
| 8.3.4. | The Fact-Finding Mission on Israeli Settlements in the Occupied Palestinian Territory..... | 208 |
| 8.4. | The Proposed Requirements and Procedures for Member Selection of Fact-Finding Missions | 208 |
| 8.4.1. | Impartiality | 210 |
| 8.4.2. | Legal Expertise | 212 |
| 8.4.3. | Management Skills | 214 |
| 8.4.4. | Geographic and Gender Considerations | 215 |
| 8.5. | Concluding Remarks | 216 |
| 9. | Purpose and Legitimacy in International Fact-Finding Bodies..... | 219 |
| | <i>By Dan Saxon</i> | |
| 9.1. | The Purpose(s) and Mandates of FFM ^s : Legal or Political? | 219 |
| 9.2. | The Marriage of Fact-Finding and Accountability | 226 |
| 9.3. | Recommendations for Future Fact-Finding Bodies..... | 230 |
| 9.4. | Conclusions | 232 |
| 10. | Witness Sensitive Practices in International Fact-Finding Outside Criminal Justice: Lessons for Nepal | 233 |
| | <i>By Christopher B. Mahony</i> | |
| 10.1. | Introduction | 233 |
| 10.1.1. | Nepal's Proposed Commission on Investigation of Disappeared Persons, Truth and Reconciliation | 234 |
| 10.1.2. | Nepal's Political Background | 236 |
| 10.1.3. | Three Key Witness-Oriented Elements Distinguishing Fact-Finding Commissions from Courts..... | 238 |
| 10.2. | Nature and Scale of the Threat to Witnesses | 240 |
| 10.2.1. | Security Sector Reform..... | 241 |
| 10.2.2. | Potential for Further Instability (Emerging Socio-Economic and Political Threats) | 242 |
| 10.2.3. | The Role of Perceived Prosecution in Exaggerating or Mitigating the Threat to Witnesses | 244 |
| 10.2.4. | Naming Names: Attributing Individual Responsibility | 246 |
| 10.2.5. | An Ambiguous Punitive Deterrent in Nepal | 247 |

| | | |
|----------|--|-----|
| 10.3. | Considering a Formal Protection Programme: Financial Security and Political Parameters | 248 |
| 10.3.1. | A Legal Framework for Witness Protection | 249 |
| 10.3.2. | Funding..... | 251 |
| 10.3.3. | Programme's Institutional Location | 255 |
| 10.3.4. | The Residual Question (When a Commission Concludes)..... | 256 |
| 10.3.5. | Personnel | 257 |
| 10.4. | State Co-operation | 260 |
| 10.4.1. | A Culture of State Non-Cooperation | 260 |
| 10.4.2. | Foreign Co-operation..... | 262 |
| 10.5. | Commission and Justice System Efficacy, Efficiency and Interdependence..... | 264 |
| 10.5.1. | Statement Taking and Other Investigatory Practices ... | 264 |
| 10.5.2. | Investigating on the Basis of Naming Names..... | 266 |
| 10.5.3. | Psychosocial Protection and Assistance | 267 |
| 10.5.4. | Anonymity | 271 |
| 10.5.5. | Post-Testimony Protection (Formal or Advised) | 276 |
| 10.6. | Conclusion..... | 280 |
| 11. | Fact-Finding in the Former Yugoslavia: What the Courts Did | 285 |
| | <i>By David Re</i> | |
| 11.1. | Introduction | 285 |
| 11.2. | The Conflicts | 287 |
| 11.3. | The Fact-Finding Missions..... | 288 |
| 11.4. | Legal Opinions of the Commission of Experts | 292 |
| 11.5. | Command Responsibility | 294 |
| 11.6. | Rape and Sexual Violence | 297 |
| 11.7. | Protected Persons for Crimes Against Humanity | 297 |
| 11.8. | Discriminatory Intent for Underlying Crimes of Crimes against Humanity..... | 298 |
| 11.9. | Definition of a Group for Genocide | 299 |
| 11.10. | Military Objectives and Cumulative Convictions | 300 |
| 11.11. | How the ICTY Used the Factual Conclusions of the Fact-Finding Reports | 301 |
| 11.12. | Crimes of 'Ethnic Cleansing' or Persecution by Bosnian Serb Authorities in Bosnia and Herzegovina..... | 309 |
| 11.13. | Siege of Sarajevo: 1992–1995 | 314 |
| 11.14. | Srebrenica Atrocity Crimes and Genocide of July 1995 | 317 |
| 11.15. | Crimes Committed by Croat and Croatian Forces..... | 318 |
| 11.15.1. | Croatia: Operation Storm August 1995..... | 319 |

| | | |
|----------|---|-----|
| 11.16. | Central Bosnia and Herzegovina Cases | 320 |
| 11.16.1. | Ahmići Massacre..... | 320 |
| 11.16.2. | ABiH Crimes..... | 322 |
| 11.17. | Kosovo..... | 323 |
| 11.18. | Macedonia | 326 |
| 11.19. | The International Criminal Court | 328 |
| 11.20. | Special Tribunal for Lebanon | 339 |
| 11.21. | Conclusion | 340 |
| 12. | International Criminal Law Outside the Courtroom: The Impact of Focusing on International Crimes for the Quality of Fact-Finding..... | 343 |
| | <i>By Dov Jacobs and Catherine Harwood</i> | |
| 12.1. | Introduction: Taking International Criminal Law Out of the Courtroom..... | 343 |
| 12.2. | Migration of ICL Concepts into International Commissions of Inquiry | 346 |
| 12.2.1. | Inclusion through the Commission's Mandate | 348 |
| 12.2.2. | Inclusion by Reason of the Interrelationship of Fields of International Law..... | 350 |
| 12.2.3. | Inclusion on the Basis of the Goal of Ensuring Accountability..... | 350 |
| 12.3. | Impact of ICL-focus on the Technical Quality of Fact-Finding..... | 352 |
| 12.3.1. | Facilitation of International Criminal Investigations ... | 352 |
| 12.3.2. | Judicialised Assessment of Veracity of Evidence | 356 |
| 12.3.3. | Use of Evidentiary Thresholds..... | 357 |
| 12.3.4. | Concerns Regarding Due Process | 361 |
| 12.4. | Impact of ICL-Focus on the Substantive Quality of Fact-Finding..... | 363 |
| 12.4.1. | Focus on International Crimes | 364 |
| 12.4.2. | Focus on Individual Accountability | 366 |
| 12.4.3. | Focus on Prosecutorial Responses..... | 369 |
| 12.5. | Conclusion: Sending ICL Back to the Courtroom? | 370 |
| 13. | Can International Criminal Investigators and Prosecutors Afford to Ignore Information from United Nations Human Rights Sources? | 375 |
| | <i>By Lyal S. Sunga</i> | |
| 13.1. | Introduction | 375 |
| 13.2. | What Kinds of Information Do International Criminal Prosecutions Need?..... | 378 |

| | | |
|--------|---|-----|
| 13.3. | Understanding the Constitutional, Legal and Political System | 379 |
| 13.4. | Meeting Evidentiary Requirements | 380 |
| 13.5. | Can UN Human Rights Information be Trusted? | 385 |
| 13.6. | The UN and Intelligence | 387 |
| 13.7. | Back to Governments | 390 |
| 13.8. | Could UN Human Rights Treaty Body Reports Inform International Criminal Investigations? | 392 |
| 13.9. | Could UN Human Rights Council Special Procedures and Investigative Missions Inform International Criminal Prosecutions? | 397 |
| 13.10. | Could Information from the Human Rights Council's Universal Periodic Review Help to Broaden Out the Picture? . | 408 |
| 13.11. | Could Information from UN Human Rights Sources Be Admitted as Direct Evidence in an International Criminal Trial? What about Hearsay? | 409 |
| 13.12. | Can International Criminal Investigators and Prosecutors Afford to Ignore Information from UN Human Rights Sources?..... | 415 |
| 14. | Non-Governmental Organisation Fact-Work: Not Only a Technical Problem..... | 417 |
| | <i>By Wolfgang Kaleck and Carolijn Terwindt</i> | |
| 14.1. | The Quality of NGO Fact-Work | 417 |
| 14.2. | Differentiating NGOs and Fact-Work Situations..... | 422 |
| 14.3. | General Problems in NGO Fact-Finding: Early Guidelines | 428 |
| 14.4. | NGO Fact-Work and Formal Investigation or Litigation | 432 |
| 14.5. | Role Conflicts | 436 |
| 14.6. | Conclusions | 440 |
| 15. | Fact-Finding and the International Humanitarian Fact-Finding Commission | 443 |
| | <i>By Charles Garraway</i> | |
| 15.1. | Introduction | 443 |
| 15.2. | The Legal Frameworks..... | 444 |
| 15.3. | The Developing Relationship | 447 |
| 15.4. | The Effect on Fact-Finding..... | 450 |
| 15.5. | Fact-Finding Bodies | 453 |
| 15.6. | What is the International Humanitarian Fact-Finding Commission? | 458 |

| | | |
|----------|---|-----|
| 15.7. | The Future of the International Humanitarian Fact-Finding Commission | 460 |
| 15.8. | The Swiss/ICRC Initiative on Strengthening Compliance with International Humanitarian Law..... | 461 |
| 15.9. | Conclusions | 463 |
| 16. | Information Technology and Quality Control in Non-Criminal Justice Fact-Work..... | 465 |
| | <i>By Ilia Utmelidze</i> | |
| 16.1. | Introduction | 465 |
| 16.2. | Possible Definitions for Fact-Finding and Information Technology | 466 |
| 16.2.1. | Fact-Finding..... | 466 |
| 16.2.2. | Information Technology..... | 468 |
| 16.3. | How Information Technology is Used for Fact-Finding Work and Its Effects on Quality Control | 470 |
| 16.3.1. | Search and Data Collection..... | 470 |
| 16.3.2. | Data Transfer | 470 |
| 16.3.3. | Document Management..... | 471 |
| 16.3.4. | Archive | 472 |
| 16.3.5. | Record Registration | 472 |
| 16.3.6. | Situation or Fact Mapping | 474 |
| 16.3.7. | Case Management..... | 474 |
| 16.3.8. | Legal Analysis | 475 |
| 16.3.9. | Statistical Analysis | 476 |
| 16.3.10. | Access to Records and Outreach | 476 |
| 16.3.11. | Knowledge Management | 476 |
| 16.4. | Conclusion | 477 |
| 17. | Human Rights Fact-Finding: Some Legal and Ethical Dilemmas | 479 |
| | <i>By Geoffrey Robertson</i> | |
| 17.1. | History | 483 |
| 17.2. | Problems and Principles | 485 |
| 17.2.1. | Funding | 485 |
| 17.2.2. | Composition of the Delegation | 485 |
| 17.2.3. | Even-Handedness | 487 |
| 17.2.4. | Obeying Local Laws..... | 488 |
| 17.2.5. | Surveillance | 489 |
| 17.2.6. | Interviewing | 490 |
| 17.2.7. | Admissions Against Interest | 492 |
| 17.2.8. | Should Fact-Finders Have Prior Knowledge? | 493 |

| | | |
|----------|--|-----|
| 17.2.9. | Should Human Rights Monitors Be Obliged to Testify in International Courts? | 494 |
| 17.2.10. | Reprisals Against Fact-Finders | 503 |
| 17.2.11. | Publication of the Report | 504 |
| 17.3. | Conclusion..... | 506 |
| 18. | Finding Facts on Facebook: Social Media in the Work of Human Rights Fact-Finding Bodies | 509 |
| | <i>By Emma Irving</i> | |
| 18.1. | Introduction | 509 |
| 18.2. | The Opportunities and Challenges of Social Media for Accountability | 513 |
| 18.3. | Myanmar | 516 |
| 18.3.1. | Background..... | 516 |
| 18.3.2. | Social Media in the 2018 Fact-Finding Mission Report on Myanmar..... | 518 |
| 18.4. | The Occupied Palestinian Territory | 527 |
| 18.4.1. | Background..... | 527 |
| 18.4.2. | Social Media in the 2019 Commission of Inquiry Report on the ‘Great March of Return’ | 530 |
| 18.5. | Observations, Concerns and Looking Forward | 535 |
| 18.5.1. | Observations | 537 |
| 18.5.2. | Concerns | 539 |
| 18.5.3. | Looking to the Future | 541 |
| 18.6. | Conclusion..... | 543 |
| 19. | International(ised) Criminal Justice at a Crossroads: The Role of Civil Society in the Investigation of Core International Crimes and the ‘CIJA Model’ | 547 |
| | <i>By William H. Wiley</i> | |
| 19.1. | Introduction | 547 |
| 19.2. | Current Level of International(ised) Investigative Capacity | 552 |
| 19.3. | Civil Society and Criminal Justice | 554 |
| 19.4. | Challenges Confronting Public Institutions Operating in the Domain of International(ised) Criminal Justice | 557 |
| 19.4.1. | International Criminal Investigations and Physical Risk..... | 557 |
| 19.4.2. | Donor Fatigue | 562 |
| 19.4.3. | The Impatience of Conflict-Affected Societies | 565 |
| 19.4.4. | The Contribution of Civil Society to International Criminal Investigations..... | 568 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 19.5. A Way Forward for International(ised) Criminal Investigations: The CIJA Model | 572 |
| 19.5.1. Origins and Operational Areas..... | 572 |
| 19.5.2. Mandate, Objectives and Operational Partners..... | 574 |
| 19.5.3. Investigative <i>Modus Operandi</i> and Evidentiary Base . | 581 |
| 19.5.4. Leadership and Oversight | 583 |
| 19.5.5. Staffing and Professional Development..... | 584 |
| 19.6. Concluding Remarks | 586 |
| Index | 589 |
| TOAEP Team..... | 603 |
| Other Volumes in the Publication Series | 605 |